

## 6. Assessment Against NSW Heritage Council's Criteria

The NSW Heritage Council has defined criteria and guidelines for assessment of heritage significance. These include the questions that should be asked in making a heritage assessment.

The questions include inclusion and exclusion guidelines. The exclusion guidelines should not be applied in isolation from the inclusion guidelines, but should be used to help in reviewing and qualifying the conclusions reached.

In accordance with the guidelines, an item is significant in terms of the particular criterion if the kind of attributes listed in the inclusion guidelines help to describe it. Similarly, the item is not significant in terms of the particular criterion if the kind of attributes listed in the exclusion guidelines help to describe it.

59 McArthur Street has been assessed against these criteria and guidelines as follows (with applicable inclusion and exclusion guidelines bolded):

| 59 McArthur Street GUILDFORD                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Assessment against NSW Heritage Council criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                         |
| (A) An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item is important in the course, or pattern, of the local area's cultural or natural history (local significance).                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                         |
| Inclusion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• shows evidence of a significant human activity</li><li>• <b>is associated with a significant activity or historical phase</b></li><li>• maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity</li></ul>                                                                                                    | The house is among the oldest in the street and the locality bound by several surrounding streets.                                                      |
| Exclusion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes</li><li>• provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance</li><li>• <b>has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association</b></li></ul>       | The modified house has lost the ability to interpret its original configuration.                                                                        |
| (B) An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of the local area (local significance) |                                                                                                                                                         |
| Inclusion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• shows evidence of a significant human occupation</li><li>• is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons</li></ul>                                                                                                                                                                                   | N/A – none of the known owners or residents are deemed to be of particular significance and their associations with the house were purely coincidental. |

| <b>59 McArthur Street GUILDFORD</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events</li> <li>• provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance</li> <li>• has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association</li> </ul>                                         | N/A – none of the known owners or residents are deemed to be of particular significance and their associations with the house were purely coincidental. |
| (C) An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (State significance); OR An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area (local significance)                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                         |
| <p>Inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement</li> <li>• is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement</li> <li>• is aesthetically distinctive</li> <li>• has landmark qualities</li> <li>• exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology</li> </ul>                       | The house has been so severely altered that it does not exemplify its original design or features.                                                      |
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is not a major work by an important designer or artist</li> <li>• <b>has lost its design or technical integrity</b></li> <li>• its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded</li> <li>• has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement</li> </ul> | The house has been so severely altered that it does not exemplify its original design or features.                                                      |
| (D) An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (State significance); OR An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (local significance).                                                             |                                                                                                                                                         |
| <p>Inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is important for its associations with an identifiable group</li> <li>• is important to a community's sense of place</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                            | N/A – as residence, the house would not have strong or special cultural associations.                                                                   |
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is only important to the community for amenity reasons</li> <li>• is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                      | N/A – as residence, the house would not have strong or special cultural associations.                                                                   |
| (E) An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                         |
| <p>Inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information</li> <li>• is an important benchmark or reference site or type</li> <li>• provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere</li> </ul>                                                                             | The house has been altered to the point when its extant fabric would not provide any substantial scientific information.                                |

| <b>59 McArthur Street GUILDFORD</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                 |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture</b></li> <li>• has little archaeological or research potential</li> <li>• only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <p>The house has been altered to the point when its extant fabric would not provide any substantial scientific information.</p> |
| <p>(F) An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                 |
| <p>Inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process</li> <li>• demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost</li> <li>• shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity</li> <li>• is the only example of its type</li> <li>• demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest</li> <li>• shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community</li> </ul>                                                                                                          | <p>The house was not rare in its original form.</p>                                                                             |
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>is not rare</b></li> <li>• is numerous but under threat</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <p>The house was not rare in its original form.</p>                                                                             |
| <p>(G) An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments (State significance); OR An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of the area's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments (local significance).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                 |
| <p>Inclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is a fine example of its type</li> <li>• has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items</li> <li>• has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity</li> <li>• is a significant variation to a class of items</li> <li>• is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type</li> <li>• is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size</li> <li>• is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held</li> </ul> | <p>Original design of the house is not apparent without a detailed analysis, and then only to a certain degree.</p>             |
| <p>Exclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is a poor example of its type</li> <li>• <b>does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type</b></li> <li>• does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <p>The house has been altered so that it has lost majority of its original characteristics.</p>                                 |

**59 McArthur Street GUILDFORD**

**Comment**

The house, in its original form, would have been a locally interesting example of a pair of semi-detached houses. However, the original 1890s pair of semis was “gentrified” c. 1927 to make it resemble a Bungalow, and was finally converted c. 1980s to a single Victorian-style residence. In the process, the house has lost the ability to interpret its original configuration. Currently, it does not meet criteria for heritage listing, largely due to its loss of integrity. It meets one inclusion guideline, by virtue of its sheer age, however, it also meets at least five exclusion guidelines.

On balance, this suggests that it should not be listed as a heritage item.

**Recommendation**

**Remove from LEP list of items of heritage significance**

**Recommended Management**

In accordance with the NSW Heritage Council guidelines, the heritage item should be photographically recorded to allow retention of information on its design and changes that it underwent over time.

## **7. Summary and Recommendation**

The house at 59 McArthur Street, Guildford, was purchased as two allotments and developed as a pair of semis c. 1897. The original houses were apparently always investment properties of the well-off members of the middle class. In the 1920s, they were converted to a single residence with attempts to mimic Interwar Bungalow features. The now single residence was restored with mock features c. 1980s. In these two major waves of alterations the house(s) have lost all ability to interpret their original design to laypersons and the general public.

Importantly, the house has developed major structural issues as a consequence of apparent ground movement. There is readily apparent evidence of separation of ceilings from walls, and of structural cracking over 1m in length and over 5mm (up to 20mm) in width. This suggests that several major structural walls would likely need to be demolished and rebuilt in the forthcoming years, which would further reduce the already diminished integrity and heritage value of the remnant fabric.

On balance, it is recommended to remove the house from the LEP schedule of heritage items. It is recommended to prepare an archival record of the house, in accordance with the NSW Heritage Council guidelines, as evidence of its current configuration.

Appendix:

1. State Heritage Inventory, datasheet entry.